Alma Mater Studiorum – Università di Bologna

DOTTORATO DI RICERCA IN
Diritto Tributario Europeo

Ciclo XXII
in co-tutela con l’Università di Tilburg

Settore Concorsuale di afferenza: 12/D2 – DIRITTO TRIBUTARIO
Settore Scientifico disciplinare: IUS/12 – DIRITTO TRIBUTARIO

TITOLO TESI

Tax Treaty Override

Presentata da: De Pietro Carla

Coordinatore Dottorato
Prof. Adriano Di Pietro

Relatori
Prof. Adriano Di Pietro

Prof. Peter Essers

Esame finale anno 2012
## Tax Treaty Override

### Table of Contents

**Chapter I - Introduction: a study about tax treaty override**

1. Scope of the study: the need of a legal systematization of tax treaty override 6
2. Methodology 11
   2.1. Three different methodological phases in order to address a systematic analysis about tax treaty override 11
   2.2. The deductive phase: possible limits to state sovereignty 11
   2.3. The inductive phase: how to develop an interpretative process on which the identification of tax treaty override can be based? The notion of tax treaty override 13
   2.4. The third phase: the application of the ‘interpretative model’ 14
3. Research questions 15
3.1. Sub-questions 16
4. Structure of the work 16
5. Acknowledgements 18

**Chapter II – Nature and origin of tax treaty override**

1. Introduction: tax treaty override and international law 19
2. The need to have a preliminary concrete look at the relationship between international and national law 23
   2.1. The U.S. treaty override doctrine 26
   2.2. The new developing Italian system refusing treaty override 32
   2.3. Germany: a new position of the Federal Tax Court seems to undermine the long tradition in favour of treaty override 34
   2.4. The Netherlands and its position against treaty override 39
3. National implementation of international law and the will of states 41
4. The will of states in relation to the binding effects of international treaty obligations 44
5. States recognition and the binding effect of international law: the existence of an international community based on the principle of sovereign equality 47
6. Article 27 of the Vienna Convention: the content of treaty obligations as an objective limit to national law 50
7. Legislative treaty override as a legal injury under the Draft Articles on State Responsibility 52
8. Concluding remarks: the incidence of international law on tax treaty override 57

**Chapter III – Structure and functioning of double tax conventions: tax treaty override**

1. Introduction: the purpose of defining tax treaty override presupposes a clear understanding of the structure and functioning of double tax conventions 61
2. Tax treaty override: structure and functioning of double tax conventions and the way they are affected by changes to domestic law 62
### Chapter IV – Interpretation of the international agreement: the occurrence and scope of tax treaty override

1. Introduction. Art. 3(2) and exit taxation: two important subject-matters in order to analyze some of the constituent elements of tax treaty override

2. An historical introduction to understand the role and functioning of art. 3(2) within the OECD Model Convention

3. Explaining the rationale of art. 3(2) of the OECD Model Convention: the correspondence between treaty relieving provisions and domestic tax provisions

4. Art. 3(2) of the OECD Model Convention and the possibility to cause a tax treaty override

5. The treaty context as a limit to tax treaty override

   5.1. ‘Internal’ and ‘external’ context

   5.2. ‘Unless the context otherwise requires’

6. A practical application of art. 3(2) of the OECD Model Convention: when a domestic deeming provision causes a treaty override

### Chapter V – Domestic anti-abuse rules and tax treaty override

1. Introduction: the relationship between domestic anti-abuse rules and tax treaty provisions

2. Domestic anti-abuse provisions and tax treaty override

3. Does treaty abuse justify tax treaty override?

4. The Dutch and the Canadian approaches: a concrete example of different notions of abuse applicable for treaty purposes

5. The specific OECD’s position about CFC legislation

6. The UK attribution of notional income on the basis of fictitious residence: which
consequences for the applicable tax treaties?

7. The French Conseil d’Etat does not accept CFC legislation which is not compliant with treaty obligations

8. The Finnish Supreme Administrative Court follows the OECD’s position

9. The Swedish Supreme Administrative Court explicitly ruled that CFC legislation can override existing tax treaties

10. Some ‘intermediate’ reflections on the position of the OECD member states concerning the relationship between CFC legislation and tax treaty provisions

11. Is art. 7(1) of the OECD Model Convention really unaffected by CFC legislation?

12. CFC legislation: the compliance of fictitious income with articles 10(5) and 21 of the OECD Model Convention

13. Concluding remarks: domestic anti-abuse rules affect tax treaty provisions

Chapter VI – Application of the ‘interpretative model’

1. Introduction: the developed ‘interpretative model’

2. The long-lasting U.S. expatriation regime and the new exit tax: recurring cases of tax treaty override in the United States

2.1 The new U.S. exit tax regime

2.2 Application of the interpretative model to the U.S. exit tax regime

2.3 The consequences deriving from the application of the U.S. saving clause

3. The ‘re-entry charge’ in the United Kingdom

3.1 Concrete evaluation of a possible case of tax treaty override on the basis of the double tax convention concluded between Italy and the United Kingdom

3.2 Conclusive remarks on the possibility of a treaty override concerning the UK ‘re-entry charge’

4. CFC legislation based on a transactional method: a further distinction

4.1 Concluding remarks on the CFC transactional method

Chapter VII – Conclusions: a legal systematization of tax treaty override

1. The origin and nature of tax treaty override: an investigation that starts within the international legal system

2. Tax treaty override as a source of international responsibility

3. An ‘interpretative model’ to identify cases of tax treaty override

4. A definition of tax treaty override and all its constituent elements

5. The application of the ‘interpretive model’

5.1. The U.S. exit tax regime

5.2. The UK ‘re-entry charge’

5.3. The transactional CFC method

6. A few final thoughts on tax treaty override

6.1. The delicate position of national judges

6.2. Consequences of tax treaty override on the overriding domestic legislation and on taxpayers: the need of an effectively binding international system

Sintesi: Tax Treaty Override

Bibliografia